#### **MINUTES**

### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

The following Supreme Court Opinions were voted on by the six sitting members of the Supreme Court on June 7, 2005, prior to Justice John C. Roach's appointment to the Court by Governor Ernie Fletcher.

133.	DEMOND T. BROWN <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY AND	2003-SC-000235-MR TO BE PUBLISHED	CHRISTIAN
	DEMOND BROWN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE COOPER - AFFIRMING. SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION.	2003-SC-000716-TG TO BE PUBLISHED	CHRISTIAN
134.	THOMAS C. BOWLING V. LEXINGTON-FAYETTE URBAN COUNTY GOVERNMENT, ET AL OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE COOPER – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000907-MR TO BE PUBLISHED	FAYETTE
135.	MARK LEO THOMAS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE COOPER – REVERSING AND REMANDING. WINTERSHEIMER, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION.	2003-SC-000989-MR TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
136.	COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. LORRIE MITCHELL OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE JOHNSTONE - REVERSING	TO BE PUBLISHED	FLOYD
137.	JACTA EST ALEA V. COURT OF APPEALS MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – DENYING.	2005-SC-000082-OA NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

### **MINUTES**

## **JUNE 16, 2005**

138.	LATIMUS JUAN WINGATE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING. COOPER, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.	2003-SC-000206-TG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FAYETTE
139.	JAMES I. DAWSON, JR., V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2003-SC-000363-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	MCCRACKEN
140.	JEFFREY ALLEN DEAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2003-SC-000374-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	CASEY
141.	RAYMOND SCOTT V. DIETTA SCOTT (NOW SUMMERS) OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2003-SC-000443-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LIVINGSTON
142.	TAMICA BEARD <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2003-SC-000915-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	OLDHAM
143.	TIMOTHY CHAMBERS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2003-SC-001063-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	GREENUP
144.	TED WILLIS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000032-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	DAVIESS

### **MINUTES**

## **JUNE 16, 2005**

145.	DARRYL A. DOWNING V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000059-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
146.	DENNIS J. ISAACS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000106-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
147.	WILLIAM J. DAUGHERTY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000198-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
148.	WILLIAM R. PAYNE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING. LAMBERT, C.J., CONCURS IN RESLT ONLY.	2004-SC-000269-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	TAYLOR
149.	GARY DEAN VAUGHN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING. JOHNSTONE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.	2004-SC-000462-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LAUREL
150.	RICKIE AKERS V. PIKE COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION, ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000631-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	PIKE
151.	CLARK REGIONAL MEDICAL CENTER V. RITA OSBORNE, ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000648-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS

## **MINUTES**

## **JUNE 16, 2005**

152.	JAMES E. EDWARDS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000649-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	BARREN
153.	MORGAN KIRK V. RUTH CONTRACTORS, ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – <u>AFFIRMING.</u>	2004-SC-000654-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	
154.	RONALD BOWLING V. THE CHISHOLM COAL CO., ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000665-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	
155.	LESTER E. COOK, JR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING.	2004-SC-000853-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	WHITLEY
156.	TASIA HOOTEN <b>V.</b> WILLIAM T. JENNINGS, JUDGE ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – <u>AFFIRMING.</u>	2004-SC-000871-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	
157.	MICHAEL A. THORNTON V. VOLT SERVICES GROUP ET AL MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - REVERSING AND REMANDING.	2004-SC-000442-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	

#### **MINUTES**

**JUNE 16, 2005** 

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

#### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS ENTERED JUNE 16, 2005**

MITCHELL ANDREW WILLIAMS V. 2003-SC-000054-DG BELL

TERESA ANN MILLS WILLIAMS NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

(NOW JEWELL)

**OPINION AND ORDER DISMISSING** 

AS MOOT.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. <u>2005-SC-000204-KB</u> IN SUPREME

BARRY SLOAN SMITH TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

OPINION AND ORDER PERMANENTLY DISBARRING RESPONDENT FROM THE

PRACTICE OF LAW IN THE COMMONWELATH

OF KENTUCKY.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. 2005-SC-000216-KB IN SUPREME

TAMMIE JONES SIVALLS **TO BE PUBLISHED** COURT

OPINION AND ORDER PERMANENTLY DISBARRING RESPONDENT FROM THE

PRACTICE OF LAW IN THE COMMONWEALTH

OF KENTUCKY.

ENVIROPOWER. LLC V. 2005-SC-000437-I FRANKLIN

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

OF KENTUCKY, ET AL

**OPINION AND ORDER DENYING** 

INTERLOCUTORY RELIEF

**PURSUANT TO CR 65.09(3).** 

ENTERED: JUNE 7, 2005

## COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW ENTERED JUNE 8, 2005

FREDERICK CARL KRAUSE III V. 2004-SC-001009-DG MCCRACKEN

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

LOUISVILLE GAS AND 2005-SC-000188-DG JEFFERSON

ELECTRIC COMPANY V.

JONATHAN MARK ROBERSON, ETC.

#### **MINUTES**

### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

JOHN ELLIS, ET AL <b>V.</b> CARITAS HEALTH SERVICES	2004-SC-000610-D	JEFFERSON
J.J.B. HILLIARD, W.L. LYONS, INC., ET AL <b>V.</b> ROBERT C. OLIVER	2004-SC-000675-D	JEFFERSON
TOMMY WELLS, ETC., ET AL <b>V.</b> LAWRENCE LEVINE, M.D.	2004-SC-000689-D	KENTON
JOHNNY CURTSINGER, ET AL <b>V.</b> JIM HURST, ETC., ET AL AND	2004-SC-000699-D	WASHINGTON
JIM HURST, ETC. V. JOHNNY CURTSINGER, ET AL COURT OF APPEALS OPINION IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	2004-SC-000749-D	WASHINGTON
SHARON TIMMONS <b>V.</b> CITY OF LOUISVILLE, ETC., ET AL	2004-SC-000776-D	JEFFERSON
HUNTINGTON NATIONAL BANK, ET AL <b>V.</b> HENRY PORTER, ET AL	2004-SC-000801-D	JEFFERSON
DONALD C. WIGGINS, ET AL <b>V.</b> THE KROGER COMPANY, ET AL	2004-SC-000802-D	CLARK
JOHN SMITH <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-000837-D	GARRARD
WILL L. MCGINNIS III <b>V.</b> ROMAN CATHOLIC DIOCESE OF COVINGTON, ET AL	2004-SC-000840-D	FAYETTE
LEONARD W. FORD <b>V.</b> E*TRADE SECURITIES, INC.	2004-SC-000857-D	OLDHAM

### **MINUTES**

### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

ELMER SCOTT DAVIS <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY TRANSPORTATION CABINET, ET AL	2004-SC-000897-D	MEADE
DAVID B. LEE <b>V.</b> JUDY KAYE LEE	2004-SC-000899-D	FAYETTE
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY LINZIE DOUGLAS RICE	2004-SC-000906-D	LESLIE
JA-RON SHAWN TEAGUE <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-000915-D	JEFFERSON
JAMES E. SMITH, ET AL <b>V.</b> STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE COMPANY, ET AL	2004-SC-000920-D	WHITLEY
BECKY JEAN SNIDER, NOW VAUGHN <b>V.</b> STANLEY WAYNE SNIDER	2004-SC-000921-D	HENRY
EDWARD W. MOORE, JR. <b>V.</b> ROBERT E. GROVERT, ET AL	2004-SC-000923-D	SCOTT
SHARON LAY, ETC., ET AL <b>V.</b> CHRISTOPHER S. ADLEY, M.D., ET AL	2004-SC-000934-D	KENTON
AARON C. TAYLOR <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-000960-D	GRANT
ROBERT SCHROERING, D.M.D. <b>V.</b> ERIC SCOTT REED	2004-SC-000963-D	SHELBY
MAHMOOD HOSSEINIPOUR, M.D., ET AL <b>V.</b> APPALACHIAN REGIONAL HEALTH CARE, INC., ET AL	2004-SC-000982-D	FAYETTE

### **MINUTES**

### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

ANDRE LAW <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-000994-D	CUMBERLAND
DAVID ALLEN PARTIN <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-001072-D	BELL
CARL D. QUILLEN <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2004-SC-001084-D	JESSAMINE
JERRY HALL <b>V.</b> CLARENCE B. CREECH, ET AL	2004-SC-001089-D	BOYD
RICK PAUL <b>V.</b> KAREN ANN KIMMEL, ET AL	2004-SC-001124-D	FRANKLIN
AMERICAN RESOURCES INS. CO., <b>V.</b> JACK ABSHER, ET AL	2004-SC-001128-D	MAGOFFIN
RAYMOND E. KING, ETC. <b>V.</b> SHARON MERCIER, ET AL	2005-SC-000024-D	NELSON
JOHN LAWSON REALTY CO., INC., ET AL <b>V.</b> DON ERLER, ET AL	2005-SC-000052-D	JEFFERSON
JOHNNY BROWN, ET AL <b>V.</b> HEALTH CARE COLLECTION SERVICE, INC., ET AL	2005-SC-000075-D	FAYETTE
RICHARD ELAM, ET AL <b>V.</b> RANDY BICKNELL	2005-SC-000083-D	WOODFORD
DEREK MANN <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000113-D	RUSSELL

#### **MINUTES**

### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

JEFFREY DEWAYNE CLARK V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2005-SC-000136-D	MEADE
DON GIBSON, ET AL <b>V.</b> BONNIE SHOULTA, ET AL	2005-SC-000154-D	MCCRACKEN
JAMES LANG, <b>V.</b> JOHN REES COMMISSIONER	2005-SC-000156-D	FAYETTE
CAROL ADAMS <b>V</b> . CITY OF SPRINGFIELD, KENTUCKY ET AL	2005-SC-000176-D	WASHINGTON
GERALD CONLEY WILLIAMS, JR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000200-D	MCCRACKEN
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY <b>V.</b> JOHN C. BROOKS	2005-SC-000203-D	ESTILL
DERRICK KRYSTYNAK <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000209-D	JEFFERSON
THOROUGHBRED LEARNING CENTER, INC., ET AL <b>V.</b> STEPPING STONES FOR CHILDREN INC.	2005-SC-000219-D	CLARK
ROBERT F. NIENHOUSE <b>V.</b> DONNA KAY NIENHOUSE	2005-SC-000221-D	SPENCER
BOARD OF EDUCATION OF BOONE COUNTY, KENTUCKY, ET AL <b>V.</b> CHARLES COURTNEY, ET AL	2005-SC-000226-D	BOONE

#### **MINUTES**

#### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

## COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW ENTERED JUNE 8, 2005

JAMES LANG <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000235-D	CAMPBELL
JERRY WAYNE WELCH <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000265-D	DAVIESS
MARION S. KINCAID <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000280-D	ANDERSON
PAUL HAWKS <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000291-D	KENTON
JIMMY MATTHEWS <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000324-D	JEFFERSON
CRAIG LOUIS DEAN MILNER <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2005-SC-000377-D	FAYETTE

#### **COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION TO TRANSFER ENTERED JUNE 16, 2005**

TASIA HOOTEN V. 2005-SC-000142-T CLARK HON. WILLIAM T. JENNINGS JUDGE, CLARK CIRCUIT COURT ET AL

KEITH DEVON EVERETT ALLEN, ETC. V. 2005-SC-000258-T HARDIN COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

#### **COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITIONS FOR REHEARING ENTERED JUNE 16, 2005**

KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS V. 2002-SC-000516-DG FRANKLIN JOYCE ANN LEWIS 2003-SC-000730-DG ORDER DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING AND GRANTING MODIFICATION OF OPINION.

## **MINUTES**

## **JUNE 16, 2005**

<b>COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITIONS FOR REHEARING ENTERED JUNE 16, 2005</b>			
A.W., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING AND MODIFYING OPINION BY SUBSTITUTION OF PAGES TO CORRECT A TYPOGRAPHICAL ERROR.	2003-SC-000424-DG	CAMPBELL	
RICHIE PHARMACAL <b>V.</b> KATHY DUNN, ET AL	2004-SC-000288-WC	FROM COURT OF APPEALS	
THOMAS C. BOWLING V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ENTERED: JUNE 7, 2005	2004-SC-000880-MR	FAYETTE	
COURT ORDERS			
R. DAVID STENGEL, ETC., ET AL <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000305-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
RICHARD BOLING, ETC., ET AL <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000332-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
KENTUCKY MEDICAL ASSOCIATION <b>V</b> . KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000336-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
RAYMOND M. LARSON, ETC. <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000347-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
IRV MAZE, ETC. <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000357-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
GEORGE W. MOORE, ETC. <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000349-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	
KENTON R. SMITH, ETC. <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION AND	2004-SC-000350-KB	IN SUPREME COURT	

#### **MINUTES**

#### **JUNE 16, 2005**

RELEASED: 2:00 P.M.

#### **COURT ORDERS**

ROY K. SNELL, ETC. V. 2004-SC-000346-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

AND

BARRY BERTRAM, ETC. V. <u>2004-SC-000339-KB</u> IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

COURT ORDER AMENDING THE OPINION ENTERED MAY 19, 2005 BY THE SUBSTITUTION OF A NEW OPINION TO CLARIFY THE IDENTIFICATION OF PARTIES COUNSEL.

ENTERED: JUNE 1, 2005 ENTERED: JUNE 9, 2005

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. 2005-SC-000238-CL LETCHER

JIMMY DEAN SCOTT

ORDER DENYING CERTIFICATION

OF THE LAW.

ENTERED: JUNE 16, 2005

## COURT ORDERS PERMITTING MOVANT TO WITHDRAW AS A MEMBER OF THE KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

JOHN BLACKBURN SOUTHARD JR. V. 2005-SC-000380-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

**ENTERED: MAY 23, 2005**